

Peer Review for 106: Evaluative Review
ENWR 106: College Writing II

Writer _____ Reviewer _____

Workshop Guidelines: As a peer reviewer, you have a responsibility to the writer of the essay you are reviewing to provide constructive and helpful criticism. PLEASE NUMBER YOUR PARAGRAPHS BEFORE GIVING YOUR ESSAY TO YOUR READERS

1. What do you like best about this paper? (What makes it interesting? Engaging?) Does the title give you a clear and specific idea of the topic of this essay?

Focus

2. Read the first paragraph.

a) What is the writer's topic?

b) Is the central claim clear, specific, and narrow? Or is it too broad? If too broad, suggest a way the writer might narrow it down by moving it, rewriting it, changing it, etc.

c) Is the central claim challenging? Is it something you agree or disagree with? Why?

Development and Analysis

3. Are there sections of the paper that are primarily summary (repeating what happens in the text) rather than analysis (breaking down and interpreting what happens)? Refer to these sections of the paper by paragraph number. (These may be sections the writer should cut out of the paper as the goal in a literary paper is analysis and original insight.)

4. Identify all the body paragraphs that do not clearly support the essay's central claim. List them here (by number) and explain the problem(s) with each.

5. Does the writer use at least one specific quotation in each body paragraph as evidence to back up the topic sentence (topic sentence is the main point for that para.)? Identify all the paragraphs in the essay that need more examples, details, and quotes to support his or her argument (cite para. #). What kind of examples, details, and/or quotes do you think the writer needs here? Be specific.

6. Identify the paragraph that provides the least analysis – where you are not given explanation as to what a quote means. Ask the writer two questions here to help the writer analyze – make meaning – of the evidence (quote) provided.

Organization

7. Select one of the least effective body paragraphs (a different one from the previous question). Cite the paragraph # and answer the following:

a) What is the main point the writer is trying to make in this paragraph? (If there is more than one point in the paragraph, indicate that.)

b) How might the point in this paragraph be better connected to the main argument? Or, do you recommend that this paragraph and point be cut out?

8. How effective are the flow and order of the paragraphs and the essay as a whole? Point out which paragraphs might be moved or combined and where better transitions are needed.

Clarity

9. Are there any quotes that are not incorporated into the writer's own sentences? Identify them by the paragraph they are in, and then rewrite one of them here in a way that incorporates the quote into a sentence.

10. Identify two sentences (by paragraph and sentence number) that need to be rewritten because of poor grammar, syntax, awkwardness, or because they are unnecessarily long. Rewrite at least one of them here without losing the writer's original point.

11. List at least two questions that you have for the writer—what would you like to know more about in this essay? What has the writer left unanswered?

To the writer: After you have read this peer review, honestly evaluate if it has been helpful to you. Will you incorporate some of the suggestions or comments into your revision? Indicate the grade you would assign this review. You may rate it using the following criteria:

A (Superior Review) – Reviewer answered all questions with thoughtful comments and suggestions that I will definitely use in my revision.

B (Good to Average Review) Reviewer answered all questions but did not offer much specific advice.

C (Poor) Reviewer glossed over the questions and gave fairly simple or pat answers with little to no specific advice.

Writer's Grade Suggestion for Review _____

Note: Be careful with your grading. Do not automatically give a high grade to be nice. Carefully and honestly evaluate the review you have been given. Was it really helpful? Did you learn from it? Will it help make your paper the best it can be?