

## Peer Review for 106: Evaluative Review

Writer \_\_\_\_\_ Reviewer \_\_\_\_\_

**Workshop Guidelines:** As a peer reviewer, you have a responsibility to the writer of the essay you are reviewing to provide constructive and helpful criticism. Put your name on the top of the draft you are reviewing as well as this worksheet. Working with the writer, read the essay aloud to him/her or have the writer read it to you. Listen carefully to determine a few points: the smooth flow of the work; the clarity of the writing; an understanding of the writer's points. Provide the writer with *constructive criticism* as well as praise. Be *honest* in your remarks and trust your own judgment. Simple "yes" or "no" answers are no help at all—explain, elaborate! Mechanical aspects of writing (spelling, punctuation) should not be your main focus, but if you do notice a problem with mechanics, just circle the problem area directly in the essay.

### PLEASE NUMBER YOUR PARAGRAPHS BEFORE GIVING YOUR ESSAY TO YOUR READERS

1. What do you like best about this paper? (What makes it interesting? Engaging?) Does the title give you a clear and specific idea of the topic of this essay?

2. Read the first paragraph.

a) What is the writer's topic?

b) What is the writer's thesis, or argument, about this topic? Underline the sentence that you feel most clearly states the writer's argument. Is the thesis statement immediately clear or did you have to hunt for it? Is it debatable?

c) Is the thesis specific and narrow? Or is it too broad? If too broad, suggest a way the writer might narrow it down.

d) Is the thesis challenging? Is it something you agree or disagree with? Why?

3. Are there sections of the paper that are more summary (just repeats what happens in the poem or story) rather than analysis (breaks down interprets what happens)? Circle these sections of the paper. (These may be sections the writer should cut out of the paper as the goal in a literary paper is analysis and original insight.)

4. Does the writer use specific examples, details, and quotes from the poem or story to support his/her argument? Name at least one paragraph in the essay that needs more examples, details and quotes (cite paragraph #). What kind of examples, details, and/or quotes do you think the writer needs here? Be specific.

5. Select one of the body paragraphs (cite paragraph #) and answer the following:  
a) What is the main point the writer makes in this paragraph? (if more than one point in the paragraph, indicate that.)

b) Is there a clear topic sentence that indicates this main point? Underline it.

c) Is the main point clearly related to the writer's argument? (Is it clear how this point supports the argument and moves it forward?)

6. List at least two questions that you have for the writer—what would you like to know more about in this essay? What has the writer left unanswered?

To the writer: After you have read this peer review, honestly evaluate if it has been helpful to you. Will you incorporate some of the suggestions or comments into your revision? Indicate the grade you would assign this review. You may rate it using the following criteria:

A (Superior Review) – Reviewer answered all questions with thoughtful comments and suggestions that I will definitely use in my revision. The reviewer offered a fresh insight and/or helpful questions that will aid in clarifying my points. Using the information from this review will absolutely make my paper better.

B (Good to Average Review) Reviewer answered all questions but did not offer much specific advice. Review is not especially detailed but I might be able to use some of the comments in my revision.

C (Poor) Reviewer glossed over the questions and gave fairly simple or pat answers with little to no specific advice. Comments are not especially carefully considered. I don't think using this advice will add anything to my paper.

Writer's Grade Suggestion for Review\_\_\_\_\_

Note: Be careful with your grading. Do not automatically give a high grade to be nice. Carefully and honestly evaluate the review you have been given. Was it really helpful? Did you learn from it? Will it help make your paper the best it can be?